ctools - Bug #2765

cscripts.obutils.residuals may have a floating-point math glitch

11/29/2018 01:56 AM - Kelley-Hoskins Nathan

Status: Closed Start date: 11/29/2018

Priority: Low Due date:

Assigned To: Knödlseder Jürgen % Done: 100%

Category: Estimated time: 0.00 hour

Target version: 1.7.0

Description

I've been looking at the statistics of csresmap when using algorithm='SIGNIFICANCE' (calculated <u>here</u>), and I ran into something odd when recreating the calculation in my python script.

The situation is: you're calculating the significance of a bin that has 7 observed counts, and 6.999999999999... modeled counts (7-<a really small number>).

\$ python

>>> d = 7

>>> m = d - 1e-14

>>> print(sqrt(d*log(d/m) + m - d))

Traceback (most recent call last):

File "<stdin>", line 1, in <module>

ValueError: math domain error

>>> d*log(d/m) + m - d

-8.881784197001252e-16

When calculating the significance (done here in csresmap), the value of

d*log(d/m) + m - d

becomes negative, and then the sqrt() throws an exception, ruining your wednesday night statistical experiments. I think its due to how python handles long floating point numbers, but I'm not sure.

Just to emphasize, I haven't actually seen this happen yet in csresmap since I don't have enough time to test it out. But I did see this when doing the same calculation with some MC statistical sims in a standalone python script, so I'm marking this as low priority, but it may be worth checking out.

History

#1 - 11/29/2018 01:59 AM - Kelley-Hoskins Nathan

*The next thing that's done with that negative number is square-rooted, which is where the sqrt() comes in.

#2 - 07/15/2020 10:00 PM - Knödlseder Jürgen

- Status changed from New to Pull request
- Assigned To set to Knödlseder Jürgen
- Target version set to 1.7.0
- % Done changed from 0 to 100

Thanks for pointing this out. This looks indeed like a numerical glitch. I force now negative residual values in obsutils.residual() to zero so that no square root error will occur.

#3 - 07/15/2020 10:15 PM - Knödlseder Jürgen

- Status changed from Pull request to Closed

04/17/2024 1/2

Merged into devel.

04/17/2024 2/2